January 1984

Reviews, Critiques, and Annotations

Alice Knierim  
*Georgia Department of Archives and History*

John S. Lupold  
*Columbus College*

Myron W. House  
*West Georgia College*

Alice Knierim  
*Georgia Department of Archives and History*

Anita K. Delaries  
*Emory University*

*See next page for additional authors*

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.kennesaw.edu/provenance

Part of the [Archival Science Commons](https://digitalcommons.kennesaw.edu/provenance)

**Recommended Citation**

Available at: https://digitalcommons.kennesaw.edu/provenance/vol2/iss2/8

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@Kennesaw State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Provenance, Journal of the Society of Georgia Archivists by an authorized editor of DigitalCommons@Kennesaw State University. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@kennesaw.edu.
Reviews, Critiques, and Annotations

Authors
Alice Knierim, John S. Lupold, Myron W. House, Alice Knierim, Anita K. Delaries, David E. Alsobrook, and Christopher Ann Paton

Teaching With Historical Records is a manual specifically designed to assist teachers with using historical records in the classroom to meet educational objectives identified in the New York social studies curriculum. However, the value of this book cannot be so narrowly defined. It is an interesting, entertaining and at times, provocative introduction to the variety of written records available to anyone interested in moving beyond the traditional textbook approach to history and into an investigation of everyday life at an earlier time.

The manual begins with this statement: "Teachers of social studies face the challenge of helping students develop a sense of history and place...Historical records provide the best evidence of social, political, economic, and other phases of community development..." Kathleen Roe, archivist with the New York State Archives, supports this contention through "theoretical discussions of how to integrate historical records into teaching activities with practical examples that demonstrate specific uses of records." Fortunately, the book does not bog down in the theoretical but moves quickly into a discussion of where to locate records and how to introduce them into the classroom. The manual becomes a model that individual teachers can follow in creating local history units based on records from their own town or county.

The book is divided into four parts. The first, "Educational Objectives," is the theoretical section and is limited to one page. Yet, in this single page Roe succinctly outlines how local records can help students develop the historical, critical thinking, and social skills necessary to become thoughtful citizens. The balance of the manual is devoted to
"Locating and Using Historical Records," "Sample Uses of Historical Records," and "Suggestions for Further Reading."

In "Locating and Using Historical Records," Roe demonstrates a knowledge of and sensitivity to the reality of the classroom and the limitations within which teachers must operate. She stresses use of locally available materials and describes various kinds of repositories. She also suggests inexpensive alternatives for copying records and urges flexibility and trial runs when primary materials are first introduced to a class.

In her explanation of the "strange land" of archives and the need for special rules for handling records, Roe de-mystifies both record repositories and the records themselves. This section is as important to archivists interested in promoting a wider use of their holdings as it is to teachers. It helps archivists see more clearly how regulations and attitudes, when unexplained and unyielding, create obstacles for users, and it further suggests how teachers and archivists can work together to open the world of historical records to students.

The major portion of this manual is devoted to an overview of several kinds of historical records: personal papers, business records, local government records, maps, photographs, broadsides, and census records. Each section includes an introduction to a particular group of records, describing how and why they were created and the kind of information they contain. These discussions raise questions, and our curiosity, as they remind us that records document real people and the daily drama of their lives. Each introduction is followed by two to four sample records, several questions to ask, and suggested classroom activities. The examples and questions reflect the rich diversity of original records and numerous directions further investigations can lead.

Roe states: "Learning local history from historical records can be an exciting, educational adventure. To share the laughter and pain of daily life, to witness the growth of a community through its government, schools, businesses, and institutions is to truly recapture the human experience." Teaching With Historical Records undoubtedly has succeeded in drawing hundreds of teachers and their students into the human experience through historical
research in primary records. The humor, pathos, and mystery of the records Roe has selected make history come alive and offer numerous possibilities for actively involving young people in the discovery of their local heritage.

Alice Knierim
Georgia Department of Archives and History

Local History Resources At Your Doorstep: A Manual for Teachers. Produced by the Atlanta Historical Society and the Georgia Department of Archives and History. Pp. 60. Illustrations, appendices, bibliography. Paper. $5.00 at Atlanta Historical Society. $5.50 to mail in-state and $6.00 to mail out-of-state by writing to the Atlanta Historical Society.

This handbook is the product of a series of workshops on local history presented to Atlanta area teachers. Directed by Alice Knierim (director of the Center for Local History Education with the Georgia Department of Archives and History) and Madeline Reamy Patchen (curator of education of the Atlanta Historical Society) and jointly sponsored by their two institutions, the course focused on local history resources and methodologies. Victoria Haynes Schwartz, an educator who worked as a governor's intern with the Atlanta Historical Society, compiled this work, which consists of a series of lesson plans divided into two sections on archival and museum resources along with an extensive appendix. The latter includes guides, sample forms, and questionnaires relating to oral history, genealogy, photographs, and cemetery studies. A list of local history resources (institutions and sites to visit in the Atlanta area and a bibliography conclude the collection.

This work should be evaluated both as a classroom tool and as an example of archival and museum outreach; it makes significant contributions in both areas. Teachers should find its lesson plans valuable, since they were prepared by their peers who participated in the workshops. The variety of topics
and ideas represents an important asset. The exercises are designed to introduce students to the differences between secondary and primary sources, to demonstrate the interpretation of primary sources, and to familiarize students with material culture of the past by visiting museums.

Other lessons discuss archival sources for family history and customs (recipes), procedures for compiling a school history, and tips for visiting museums and the State Capitol. Among the most informative plans is a series relating to photographs: a discussion of the types of nineteenth century images and instructions for processing, preserving, and interpreting photographs.

Later editions of this volume and similar handbooks might be strengthened by adding facsimiles of documents, letters, and maps which could be reproduced for class use. Also lacking is an extended discussion of architectural history. This omission probably stems from the difficulty in preparing such an article (since Maurie Golsen, a former preservation planner, did make such presentations to the workshops). Despite the existence of many guides to architecture and several articles relating how to use them in the classroom, there is still a need for localized guides to architecture, and this type of publication might be a good vehicle for such studies. Viewed collectively, however, this manual will serve as a valuable aid to classroom teachers. Employing its ideas, teachers can excite their students' curiosity about local history and history in general.

Developing an understanding of local history might also give these students an appreciation for the institutions that preserve local history: archives and museums. Given the goals of the Society of American Archivists Task Force on Archives and Society, it would seem that such projects aimed at elementary and middle-grade students should not be just desirable, but mandatory, if archivists are really going to inform the general public of the role of archivists in society.

John S. Lupold
Columbus College (Georgia)
The second edition of the University of Washington Libraries' Manual continues its function as the in-house publication containing the institution's rules and procedures. However, interest in the Manual derives not just from the rules and procedures, but also from the sizable amount of theory included, almost one-third of the Manual being devoted to discussion of archival theory. Also, although Library Director Richard C. Berner claims that the Manual is the product of the entire staff, evidently, as in the first edition, Berner's input was substantial, for he acknowledges that the new edition was prepared as a direct result of work on his recently-published book on archival theory and practice.

There are no shocking departures in either theory or practice. However, two particular points do merit discussion. These were noted by Clifton Jones in his excellent review of the first edition in the Spring 1981 issue of Georgia Archive.

First, the Manual advocates a unitary approach to the treatment of archival and manuscript collections. This stance is understandable in a library whose manuscripts and archives divisions are united. However, the two types of materials are not identical, and it should be remembered that to treat them as such is probably more a matter of practicality than ideal procedure.

Second, the Manual restricts subject analysis to a record group or subgroup level, so that subject analysis becomes "limited to identification of primary topical characteristics of a given accession." The inflexibility of the Manual on this matter may be questioned, for why should not some departure be allowed in depth of subject analysis if the importance of a particular file seems to warrant such description?

The rewriting of the Manual so that there are
no lengthy addenda is a definite improvement over the first edition in which one-third of the content was devoted to addenda. Now, the "Corporate Entry Guide" and the "Scope Notes for Subject Headings" may be obtained at cost upon request.

These things considered, both as a pattern for practice and as a professional statement, the second edition of the Manual is a fine addition to the growing number of such publications.

Myron W. House
West Georgia College


It is as a tribute to the photographic talent of Alvan Harper that this work is most successful. Joan Perry Morris, curator of the Florida Photographic Collection, Division of Archives, History and Records Management of the Florida Department of State, relates in her introductory essay all that is known about Harper and his photographs. A Philadelphia portrait photographer, Harper moved to Tallahassee in 1884 and for the next twenty-five years recorded the city and its surroundings. By chance, sixteen hundred of his glass-plate negatives have survived and are now housed in the Florida Photographic Archives. Morris notes that, in keeping with contemporary practice in books of archival photographs, the images have been grouped in various categories; they have not been cropped; and imperfections caused by cracks or flaking emulsion have been left unretouched, reminding one of the
hazards the negatives have survived.

The images are printed on heavy, coated stock in a simple brown tone. Each photograph is given a separate page with sizes ranging from half to full page in this nine inch by twelve inch volume. The quality of the prints is remarkable, particularly given the condition of some of the negatives, and is a tribute to Morris and Will Roy McDaniel of the Florida State University Photo Laboratory. Since all identifications are included in the List of Plates preceding the photographs, nothing detracts from the images themselves. We are confronted only by Harper's portraits and scenes that still speak so eloquently after seventy-five to one hundred years. The very life and force of Harper's work and the photographic quality of the volume make it a worthy addition to any collection of photographic books.

However, this lay-out and organization hamper the book's usefulness as an historical resource. The separate list of identifications makes for an irritating flip-flopping of pages for those as interested in the identifications as in the images. Morris mentions the plates are grouped in various categories, but these categories are not revealed. Some, such as transportation, are rather obvious. Others, however, are not. For example, the first grouping seems to concentrate on representatives of various occupations—surveyor, fireman, waiter, carpenter, but then the group ends with portraits of a cadet at West Florida Seminary, a priest, and a woman dressed in mourning. The reader knows there are deliberate groupings but is unable to find the key to them.

In addition, the criteria for selecting the 101 images included in the volume are not explained. Again, some choices are obvious, such as the plate of the Walkatomica, the only image of the only Tallahassee-built steamship, and those of the Leon Hotel and the county courthouse. Other plates and identifications offer less to explain their inclusion, although all are inherently interesting to the photographer and the historian alike.

These problems are diminished in part by the concluding essay by Lee H. Warner, Director of the Museum of Florida History, Division of Archives, History and Records Management of the Florida Department of State. That essay, "Alvan Harper's
Tallahassee," succeeds in creating an historical context for the images. Viewed in connection with Warner's essay, Harper's photographs become even more valuable historical documents reflecting the city's eagerness for development and economic diversification at the turn of the century, as well as reluctance to depart from its deep-rooted heritage. The ambivalent situation of blacks in post-Reconstruction Florida and the rather rigid economic lines of the city's white population are conveyed as well. The placement of this essay is a puzzlement, however. Because it sheds so much light on Harper and his subjects, historians might prefer that it precede the plates. Students of historical photography, on the other hand, undoubtedly would agree with its placement as an end-note to the plates themselves.

Despite these problems of organization, The Photographs of Alvan S. Harper is a useful and interesting work that allows a rare glimpse into a limited time period in the history of a city. Although the portion of Harper's work that remains gives a partial and enigmatic view of this world, it is fortunate that he moved outside his studio and assumed the mantle of social historian as he recorded people and places and events evidently for their own sake.

Alice Knierim
Georgia Department of Archives and History


The publication of The Craft of Public History, "Under the Auspices of the National Council of Public History," is something of an historical event in itself. It marks the appearance of the first comprehensive annotated bibliography on public history and demonstrates the wide range of activities
in which historians -- as public historians -- participate today and might participate in the future. Divided into eleven topical chapters, the book is designed to provide both an introduction to a variety of public history subspecialties and a set of annotations for each of those subspecialties. The topics covered include traditional as well as recent public history subspecialties, ranging from the expected "Archives, Records and Information Management," "Library Science," and "Genealogy and Family History" to the more novel "Public History: Business Management," "Historical Resource Management," or "Media and History." The book is rounded out with chapters on "Public History: Research and Writing," "Public History Training," "Historical Editing," "Oral History," and "Policy History."

As an annotated bibliography, Craft offers exactly 1,700 works spread among the eleven chapters. Each chapter is divided by its author into subsections which contain a number of fairly detailed annotations. The quality of the annotations varies considerably among the authors, but all are effective as guides to the publications being evaluated. Some chapters are better than others in providing more comprehensive bibliographies. The sections on "Archives, Records and Information Management" and "Genealogy and Family History," for example include annotations on important periodicals; the sections on "Public History: Business Management" and "Policy History" do not. Most chapters reflect the current state of the art in their specialties, although specialists in the various subfields will likely discover important omissions and perhaps dispute the authors' selections.

The annotations suffer from an annoying reluctance to reveal the relative merits of the key works in each specialty. With the exception of a brief comment on key works and gaps in the literature in the excellent introduction to "Historical Editing" by Suellen Hoy, the authors do not assist the reader in separating the key works from the more peripheral. A brief commentary on classics, most influential works, or works-to-be-read-first would have helped the nonspecialist.

Despite these weak spots, The Craft of Public History succeeds admirably as an annotated
bibliography. It is less successful, however, as an introduction either to public history as a general field or to the various subspecialties of public history. The book could have used a general introduction which carefully defined public history as a field, differentiating it from academic history and delineating key trends and future prospects. This would have been less necessary had the individual chapter introductions taken on the task. They do not attempt such synthesis, however, and the reader can develop a sense of the basic characteristics of each specialty only by working through the annotations.

The Craft of Public History demonstrates that public history is a viable, dynamic field with its own traditions and achievements. This is an invaluable contribution, for it serves to define the field for all interested professionals. The book also demonstrates the range of public history activities and reveals the quality of public history scholarship. This point deserves emphasis since, as Lawrence B. de Graf states in "Public History: Research and Writing," public history scholarship should not be regarded as somehow inferior to academic work. The methodologies and the research and writing skills of public historians are, and rightly should be, identical to those required for academic historians. Craft is an important, visible testimonial to this fact. Finally, the book offers both public historians and interested, academic historians a useful reference tool—a comprehensive, annotated bibliography. It draws together the work of several decades in an attractive and accessible form. It is unlikely to be superseded for some time.

D. Lorne McWatters
D. Roth & Associates, Inc.
Atlanta, Georgia

This book is a masterful analysis of the indigenous brand of progressivism which emerged in the South prior to World War I. In his bibliographical essay, Dewey Grantham describes this study as "a synthesis and a tentative interpretation of social reform in the early twentieth-century South" (p. 423). His interpretation is a carefully reasoned blend of the views of C. Vann Woodward, Arthur S. Link, George B. Tindall, and other well-established historians and of the recent findings of a new generation of scholars, including Robert Wiebe, Sheldon Hackney, Morgan Kousser, and Blaine A. Brownell. Although Grantham gives credit to the scholarship of others, his own prodigious research is readily evident in this volume.

The author argues that Southern progressivism had its origins in the region's restructured political landscape of the early 1900s. The Southern electorate was gradually shrinking because of disenfranchisement and the Democratic Party's systematic control of the electoral process. Bourbon Democrats' beliefs in social unity, class distinctions, racial paternalism, and in the reconciliation of cultural traditions with economic innovations were partially absorbed into the South's political ethos after 1900. The Bourbons' opponents within the Democratic Party adopted several planks of the old Populist platform—railroad regulation, public education, penal reform and the initiative, referendum, and direct primary as methods of "cleansing" the ballot box. Thus, Grantham asserts, the South's Populist tradition "flowed in a somewhat attenuated but distinct current into the politics of the progressive era" (p. 419), nurturing a "vigorous intraparty factionalism" (p. 13) and preparing the way for later reforms.
Grantham's progressives were urban, middle class professionals, businessmen, editors, ministers, educators, social workers, legislative lobbyists, public health specialists, and other reform-minded citizens. They had little faith in the intelligence and judgment of the masses; therefore, they favored very limited social and political reforms. They continually wrestled with the relationship between the forces of modernization and traditional Southern values. Although they were a rather disparate collection of reformers, Southern progressives agreed upon the necessity of imposing greater social order, fostering economic development and governmental efficiency, and protecting weak and unfortunate citizens in certain deserving cases. As racial paternalists, they supported segregation as the best means of dealing with The Negro Question.

Relying upon shifting, loosely coordinated coalitions, Southern progressives pursued a variety of reforms. The author painstakingly traces the struggles for railroad regulation, prohibition, child welfare and labor legislation, women's suffrage, and electoral and agricultural reforms. He devotes considerable attention to the significant roles played by women in behalf of these reforms and various community projects. In discussing progressive legislation in the various Southern states, Grantham probably could have strengthened his analysis by providing more details about the results of these reforms. Moreover, he could have buttressed his thesis of Southern progressivism as a series of limited reform movements by drawing direct comparisons with the experiences of other regions.

By the time of the United States' entry into World War I, the progressive movement had become national in scope. The federal government's efforts to control railroads and the prohibition crusade symbolized the nationalization of reform. Through the influence of Southern congressmen and senators, the government expanded its various regulatory functions and services to the states. In response to demands from the Farmers' Union, for example, the government established agricultural subsidies, credit facilities, and farm demonstration programs. These measures foreshadowed the sweeping agricultural reforms of the New Deal. A number of conservative Southerners feared the growing tendency toward
national reform and the proliferation of government regulations. Many Southern progressives, however, favored national solutions to their problems, intersectional accommodation, and a stronger regulatory role for the government.

By the early 1920s, Grantham asserts, Southern reformers were exhausted from the campaigns for prohibition and women's suffrage. They grew increasingly negative and defensive in outlook. The Ku Klux Klan and Protestant fundamentalism were on the rise, and many Southern progressives campaigned for the preservation of public morality and traditional values. Such coercive reformism led to the implementation of blue laws, movie censorship, and other measures to regulate morality. Civic boosterism and business progressivism characterized the course that many Southern cities pursued after 1920.

In assessing the impact of Southern progressivism, Grantham frankly admits, "Its spirit was probably more important than its reform accomplishments" (xvi). He adds that the progressives exerted a significant influence over the South's political and social thought because they effected a "synthesis of the antithetical approaches of the Bourbons and Populists" (p. 418). Although these progressives were torn between the forces of the past and the present, they were the first Southerners to seek rational solutions to the social problems of a modern, urbanized region.

Historians, political scientists, sociologists, and other serious students of the South will find this work of great interest. One note of caution: The casual reader may be overwhelmed by the mass of detail in the text and footnotes. Not only has Grantham created a conceptual framework for examining Southern progressivism, he has compiled an exhaustive historiographical inventory of research in the field. The excellent index and bibliographical essay and the detailed footnotes will lead scholars to other related topics for further investigation and will assist archivists in processing manuscript collections and in assisting researchers. This volume undoubtedly will become the definitive work on Southern progressivism.

David E. Alsobrook
Carter Presidential Materials Project

Congressman Charles E. Bennett, who has authored five books on early Florida history, has done much to rescue a short but important period of Georgia-Florida history from obscurity in his most recent work. As one who cherishes historical documents, he has included many of his own translations of material in the Charles E. Bennett Collection, Library of Congress. The narrative provides a context for the documents.

A strength of the book is that the author makes sense out of a tortuously complicated situation. The story can be quickly summarized. Georgians believed that their frontiers would not be safe from Indian threats as long as the Spanish occupied Florida. Old Indian fighters like General Elijah Clark and Colonel Samuel Hammond eagerly fell in with a plot hatched by Citizen Edmond Genet to invade Florida on behalf of the French government. Hammond had an additional reason in that he hoped to gain for his trading house the Indian commerce enjoyed by Panton, Leslie and Company.

The fifth column in the conspiracy were the Georgians who had settled in Florida and had become Spanish subjects, notably John McIntosh. The plot was discovered when Abner Hammond, Samuel's brother, went to Florida to alert the conspirators and allowed incriminating papers to fall into the hands of the authorities. Abner Hammond and John McIntosh were jailed for a year while officials interrogated everyone they could find. The testimony thus gathered makes up a good portion of Bennett's book.

With the plot discovered, Elijah Clark called off the Florida invasion in favor of his curious Trans-Oconee adventure. Meanwhile, Citizen Genet had been recalled, and President Washington was determined to maintain neutrality. The Spanish
authorities decided that it was safe to release the plotters since there was "no penalty for the crime of thought" (p. 166). Incredibly after months of protesting their innocence, McIntosh and his friends then started their revolution, capturing a Spanish fort on the St. John's River. The uprising was quickly suppressed and the ringleaders escaped into Georgia. They were tried in absentia and sentenced to be hanged, drawn and quartered. their heads were to be posted "to serve as a warning to others." Nobody was actually executed, but the conspirators took the hint. They did not return to Florida, not even when coaxed to do so by the British.

Whereas the casual reader might be put off by the numerous documents, the inclusion of these documents will be welcomed by archivists, historians, and history buffs alike. Students of Georgia history will find useful information in testimonials such as those of Daniel McMurphy (pp. 150-165) and Abner Hammond (pp. 205-206).

Edward J. Cashin
Augusta College (Georgia)

Information storage expert Waegemann helps records managers choose appropriate storage measures and equipment and also illustrates ways to use existing systems more efficaciously. He compares hard copy versus microform costs, reviews retention policies and varieties of mobile shelving, discusses rotary systems, and includes a list of professional publications and recommended readings.


Intended for in-house nonprofessional conservation measures, the manual outlines and illustrates methods for repair and cleaning of paper, rebacking and rebinding, making preservation enclosures, and instructions for making pamphlet bindings. A glossary and directions for economically equipping a workshop provide librarians with an easy-to-follow resource.


ARL's Kit #102 contains examples of thirty-four current copyright policies in use in libraries today, including four for manuscripts and archival depositories. Forewarned to encourage the greatest possible production and consumption of the written word, librarians/archivists tread a fine line: how much could or should be copied; what are the responsibilities with reserve collections; and what should intra or inter library copying guidelines be.
Questions on music and media reproduction, as well as the copyright problems with unpublished materials, are also covered.

Sources for Social History Research. Catalog Department SH3, National Archives, Washington, D.C. 20408. $2.00 each. (No charge to organizations, research facilities, and associations requesting copies for public use.)

Each catalog in this series contains descriptions of the records in the National Archives and the information in them, administrative histories of the agencies involved, and roll-by-roll listings of the archives' microfilm. Catalog titles should be precisely specified:

- **Black Studies** - Freedmen's Bureau and other records
- **American Indians** - Evolution of Federal policies towards Indians
- **Immigrant and Passenger Arrivals** - Available passenger lists
- **Military Service Records**
- **Genealogical and Biographical Research** - Little-known records including amnesties, naturalizations, courts, taxes, etc.


National Geographic Society has assisted in the publication of this high-quality, new magazine, and William Seale edited the first issue. It contains articles on the Kennedy Rose Garden, White House silver, stonework restoration, and reprints the 1865 memoir of Paul Jennings, who was a slave of James and Dolley Madison. The journal is lavishly illustrated with historical photographs.
From SAA:


Extensive illustrations, a glossary and bibliography emphasize that conservation should be considered an integral part of existing archival and curatorial functions.


The manual encourages museums to preserve their records and provides guidelines on starting an archival program with basic archival procedures.